

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION AGENDA

Tuesday, October 18, 2016

6:00 p.m.

50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B

Applicants or their representatives must attend this meeting. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next meeting. If you have any questions, please call Connie Torbeck (645-0664) in the City's Historic Preservation Office. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting due to a disability under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-6504 or email raisbell@columbus.gov at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, November 8, 2016
–
50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room A
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:00 pm, Tuesday, November 15, 2016 –
50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, September 20, 2016.
- VII. PUBLIC FORUM
- VIII. STAFF APPROVALS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

- 1. **16-10-15** (*not required to attend*)
920 North High Street
Mark Olson/ArchAll (Applicant) **Emerald ECP Short North (Owner)**
Item # 1 was moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the October 11th, 2016 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).
Modify Previous Approval/New Construction/Trash & Mechanicals Enclosure
- 2. **16-10-17** (*not required to attend*)
148-150 Detroit Avenue
Urban Restorations (Applicant/Owner)
Item # 2 was moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the October 11th, 2016 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).
Landscaping for New Construction



HOLDOVERS

3. 16-9-18b

55 Warren Street

Hannah Thompson (Applicant)

Jason & Hannah Thompson (Owners)

The landscaping portion of this application was approved at the September 20, 2016 IVC hearing. The portion of the application for repair/replacement of the public and service sidewalks was continued with the stipulation that the applicants could work with Historic Preservation Office staff to achieve a solution that retains the existing brick public sidewalk. Service sidewalk could be retained as brick or replaced with concrete bordered by brick. No new information has been submitted.

New Sidewalks

- Remove the existing brick, public and service sidewalk and install new, concrete sidewalk, to match neighboring properties. Border concrete walk with salvaged brick.

4. 16-8-20a (not required to attend)

1014 North High Street

Brent Racer/New Avenue Architects & Engineers (Applicant)

Fireproof Partners, LLC (Owner)

Item # 4 was moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the October 11th, 2016 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).

Expand Patio

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:05 P.M.

5. 16-8-23b

1100 North High Street

Jeff Parenteau (Applicant)

Giannopoulos Properties (Owner)

This application was continued from the August 16, 2016 IVC hearing. An application, photos, site plan, and product example photos have been submitted.

New Addition

- Build additional bathroom facility at the east end of the building, per the submitted drawings.

Landscape/Hardscape (Withdrawn - To be submitted by another Applicant)

- Pave the existing asphalt parking area with a combination of stamped concrete and washed gravel, per the submitted site plan and product cut sheets.
- Install plantings, per the submitted site plan and plant list.

Outdoor Bar Withdrawn (Withdrawn - To be submitted by another Applicant)

- Retain the existing outdoor bar, as built.

Install New Signage (Withdrawn - To be submitted by another Applicant)

- Install one (1) new, brass-wrapped sign with laser-cut, 3D brass, raised letters.

Install Lighting (Withdrawn - To be submitted by another Applicant)

- Install lighting for use at “clean up” at end of night only.



IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:15 P.M.

6. 16-9-30

195 Punta Alley (rear of 192-194 E. Second Ave.)

Joseph Huber (Applicant/Owner)

This application was continued from the September 20, 2016 IVC hearing. An application, site plans, and elevation drawings have been submitted.

- Construct a new, Brick, two-story, single-family dwelling and attached garage, facing onto Punta Alley.
- Roof shingles to be from the approved roofing shingles list.
- Foundation to be brick.
- Common access drive from Punta Alley, for existing house at 192 E. Second Avenue, to be on the East side of new construction.
- Windows to be Weathershield aluminum-clad wood, 1/1 DHS.
- Front entry and service doors to be AIM Millican Series, mahogany doors, per the submitted cut sheet.
- Overhead garage door to be 8' Clopay Gallery collection, steel door, per the submitted cut sheet.
- Exterior lighting to be per the submitted cut sheets.

NEW APPLICATIONS

7. 16-10-18 (not required to attend)

995 North Fourth Street

Adrienne Consales (Applicant)

Capitol Equities (Owner)

Item # 7 was moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the October 11th, 2016 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).

Install New Signage

Install New Lighting

8. 16-10-19 (not required to attend)

200 (201) East Fourth Avenue

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Heidi Koestner (Owner)

Item # 8 was moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the October 11th, 2016 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).

Alterations to Façade



IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:25 P.M.

9. 16-10-20

843 Summit Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Blue Chip Development (Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the September 20, 2016 IVC hearing. An application, photographs, site plan, floor plans, and elevation drawings have been submitted.

Build New Addition

- Restore existing wood siding or install new siding on existing building.
- Build new, two-story, rear addition, per the submitted drawings.
- Exterior siding to be horizontal wood siding, of larger profile than existing house.
- Windows to be one-over-one, double-hung sash.
- Install new, dimensional asphalt shingles.
- Install standing-seam-metal roofing on side porch.
- Install new, Simpson, full lite wood door at rear entrance.

Existing Building

- Restore existing wood siding or install new siding on existing house.
- Remove all existing windows on existing house. Install new JeldWen, Sitrine, wood windows.
- Repair/replace existing asphalt roofing, as needed.

The following is from the September 20, 2016 IVC hearing:

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- *This is an unusual section of Summit Street with varying frontages. The existing cottage has some characteristics worth preserving, so glad to see that is being considered.*
- *Thinks a larger scale addition can work at this particular site. It could actually be a compliment from the street.*

David Cooke:

- *Because the proposed addition is so far back, it does not appear that it will be as visible as it appears in the drawing. You cannot drive around this building, so a larger scale rear addition will be less noticeable.*
- *Is glad to see the inappropriate shutters being removed.*
- *The final materials and colors will be important. There should not be too much of a color contrast to avoid drawing attention to the change in scale between the existing and new addition.*

Todd Boyer:

- *Not totally in favor of dormers on the proposed addition, but understands the desire for extra height.*
- *Just be mindful of the change in scale between the existing and the new addition.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

10. 16-10-21 (Conceptual)

843 Summit Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

The New Victorians (Owner)

An application and site plan have been submitted.

New Construction

- First conceptual review for construction of a new six-family development, per the submitted site plan.



11. 16-8-30b

608-610 N. High Street & 14-20 E. Poplar Street

Antonio Colosimo/3D Group, Inc. (Applicant)

C&W 608 N. High LLC (Owner)

Alterations to the east and west elevations were approved at the September 20 2016 IVC hearing. The S. Poplar Street elevation portion of the application was continued to allow the applicant time to discuss the proposed sidewalk/park outdoor seating with Recreation and Parks.

New Storefronts/South Elevation

- Install new wood knee-walls and insulated storefront glazing.
- Install two (2) new NanaWall systems, open to patio, per the submitted drawings.
- Transoms on storefronts to be re-glazed.
- Existing second floor windows to remain.
- Existing exterior light fixtures to be cleaned and painted.

Individual Pedestrian Doors/South Elevation

- Replace the existing door, east of the westernmost group of storefronts with new hollow metal door for access to basement. Paint to blend in with adjacent brick walls.
- Retain the adjacent, existing, full-light, wood door for access to second floor tenant space.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:45 P.M.

12. 16-9-32

893 North Fourth Street (aka 901 N. Fourth St.)

Troy Brummel/WSA Studio (Applicant)

Carl Graham/Victor 901, LLC. (Owner)

Construction of a new, 3.5 story mixed use building was approved June 21, 2016/COA# 16-6-21. Modifications to the building are being proposed by a new owner. An application, site plan, floor plans, elevation drawings, landscape plan, and materials have been submitted.

New Construction/Modify Previous Approval

- Change the previously approved height from 48' to 52' to accommodate the change in use from residential to commercial.
- Reduce the building footprint based on city site compliance requirements to widen the existing alley.
- Modify west elevation to accommodate garage doors for the business occupying the first floor.

Request for Variance Recommendation

- Request for a parking variance to accommodate 18 parking spots on site. The requirement is for 26 spots. Applicant expected a 50% reduction factor but were allowed only 25%. The amount of parking provided has not changed, but the number required has changed.

Landscape Plan

- Install new asphalt parking lot, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new concrete at College Alley and south alley, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new plantings, per the submitted site plan.

The following is from the September 20, 2016 IVC hearing:

Commissioner Comments:

Josh Lapp:

- *Thinks the Fourth Street elevation is improved since the previous approval.*
- *Doesn't think the height change has much of an impact because it is set back.*

Jason Sudy:

- *Having trouble understanding the delivery through the glass garage doors in regard to the interior space and the parking spaces in front of the doors. It seems non-compatible with the parking variance request.*
- *Seems like the front of cars would hit the glass garage doors. Is it a garage or a wall? How will the loading and unloading work?*



- Please provide a narrative regarding where and how parking will work including employees, deliveries, etc.
- Not sure about the HardiePlank on the rear. Would like more clear information.
- Would like more information regarding all the metal doors on the north elevation. It feels like the back of the building. It feels more industrial. Would like to see it have more of a feel of a celebrated entrance.
- The front of the building is fine, though, preferred it with two entrances.
- Is okay with the change of height and the footprint change.

Note: It was noted that the Italian Village Society will be sending a letter to the Department of Public Service, advocating for brick pavers in College Alley and for the use of brick pavers for alleys in Italian Village in general.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (2-0-2 [Boyer – Cooke]) CONTINUED

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:00 P.M.

13. 16-10-22

900 North High Street

Elford Development/United Dairy Farmers, Inc. (Applicant)

United Dairy Farmers, Inc. (Owner)

Demolition of the existing, ca. 1978, one-story commercial building and construction of new, four-story, mixed use building was conditionally approved September 20, 2016 (see below).

An application, photos, floor plans, and renderings have been submitted. Applicant seeks approval.

Requests for Variance Recommendation

- 1) 3309.14(A), Height Districts, to increase permitted height from 35 feet to 54 feet.
- 2) 3312.49(A)(B), Minimum Number of Parking Spaces Required, to reduce parking for the 50,000 SF +/- office, retail and restaurant uses from 213 parking spaces to 13 spaces on-site, subject to 57 parking spaces being provided for the office use(s) between 6AM and 7PM weekdays, within 750 feet of the site.
- 3) 3312.53, Minimum Number of Loading Spaces Required, to reduce required loading spaces from 1 to 0 for the 50,000 +/- square foot building.
- 4) 3356.11, C-4 District Setback Lines, which Section requires a minimum building setback of 60 feet (North High Street, 4-2D arterial) and 15 +/- feet (East First Avenue, existing building to the east), while applicant requests zero (0) building setback on both streets in keeping with the historic commercial corridor and Italian Village Commission approval.

The following is from the September 20, 2016 IVC hearing:

Based on the site plan and renderings (dated September 06, 2016) and the materials samples submitted for the September 20, 2016 Italian Village Commission hearing, the Commission grants Conditional Approval for Application #16-8-34, 900 North High Street, for construction of a new, four-story, mixed use building in regard to the following items, and with all clarifications, as noted:

Demolition

- Demolish the existing, ca. 1978, one-story commercial building.
- Applicant is to submit a written narrative description of the building, including basic, overall measurements, and photographic documentation of the interior and exterior of the building, prior to demolition.

Reasons for Approval of Demolition:

The building is not a contributing building within the historic context of the Italian Village Historic District, and does not possess historical or architectural significance.

New Construction

- Construct a new, four-story, mixed use building.
- Footprint, scale, height, massing, and exterior materials are approved, with Applicant to return for final review and approval of elevation drawings, windows, doors, streetscape elements, landscape plan, exterior lighting, and signage.
- Exposed fasteners are not to be used on the vertical siding.
- No metal coping is to be used on the RockCast section of the building.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (4-0-0) CONDITIONAL APPROVAL GRANTED



IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:15 P.M.

14. 16-8-33

750 North High Street

Brian Peterson (Applicant)

Columbus Metropolitan Housing Authority (Owner)

This project was conceptually reviewed at the June 21, August 16, and September 20, 2016 IVC hearings. An application, photos, site plan, and elevation drawing have been submitted.

Renovation for Hotel

- Renovate the existing Bollinger Tower building for use as a commercial hotel.
- Hotel to include a maximum of 190 rooms, including conference rooms and exercise facility.
- Additional off-site, valet parking spaces to be leased to supplement 35 existing, on-site spaces.
- Existing windows to be removed and replaced with units integrating the necessary mechanical grilles.
- Existing EIFS exterior walls and sunscreens to be painted.
- Two single-story build-out structures will be added to the High Street portion of the site, including a 1500 sq. ft. retail space to the north, and an expansion to the hotel lobby spaces with roof terrace to the south.
- Retail building to include a combination of aluminum storefront and stone veneer.
- Hotel lobby expansion to include a combination of brick and aluminum storefront.
- Plaza space between two additions will be renovated to provide a semi-public plaza off High Street.

The following is from the September 20, 2016 IVC hearing:

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

- *Has no objection to the northern block being two story exterior with one story interior space. Thinks the exterior should reflect the one story interior rather than have a faux two story appearance. Consider the Winders building at Hubbard and High.*
- *Take a look at moving the northern block back a bit to provide a little variation in the facade with the neighboring retail space.*
- *Will need to see a complete parking plan, including off-site parking and valet parking details.*
- *Will be interesting to see how the exterior lighting is balanced.*

Todd Boyer:

- *Likes the addition of the north piece being two story.*
- *Appreciates that there are doors to the north, so they are not all just facing High Street.*
- *Is okay with the proposed landscape plan, but would like to hear discussion as to whether it is being divided up too much.*
- *Need to have a better understanding of the metal pieces - break metal or steel?*
- *Is okay with the louvered pieces above.*

Jason Sudy:

- *Appreciates the effort put into the public spaces.*
- *The segmentation of the public spaces could serve to formalize the entryway in a way that addresses the street, which is not done now.*
- *The handicap ramp is a pretty elegant solution.*
- *The scale of the park spaces is good.*
- *The high end materials on the additions and in the public spaces will provide the impression of quality for this building.*
- *Appreciates the submitted parking analysis. Will be interested to have more details regarding the relay system.*
- *Does not think there will be an additional burden on parking due to the renovations.*

NO ACTION TAKEN



IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:25 P.M.

15. 16-9-33

Waldron Street Community Center

Rob Harris (Applicant)

Jeffrey New Day Community Authority (Owner)

An application, site plan, floor plans, elevation drawing, and materials cut sheets have been submitted.

New Community Center/Leasing Office

- Construct a new community center and leasing office, per the submitted drawings.
- Exterior cladding to be brick and Shou-Sugi-Ban siding, per the submitted cut sheets, and as reviewed at the September 20th IVC hearing.
- Windows to be black storefront window systems, with brick sills and lintels.
- Exterior lighting to be per the submitted cut sheets.
- Industrial art to be per the submitted renderings.

New Pocket Park

- Install a new pocket park, per the submitted site plan and materials example photographs.
- Park to include architectural concrete benches, decorative pedestrian light poles, and a fountain.

The following is from the September 20, 2016 IVC hearing:

Commissioner Comments

Josh Lapp:

- *Appreciates the landscaping. It will be a good addition in relation to the existing Vetro lofts building.*
- *Thinks the smaller scale of the proposed building is appropriate for the site.*
- *More activity along the street edge would be helpful.*

David Cooke:

- *Thinks the landscape plan is terrific, but would like to see some fun added to it; less serious or office-like.*
- *Would like to see urban art added.*
- *Some signage and lighting should be added for night usage; possibly recessed lighting beneath the canopy.*

Todd Boyer:

- *The landscape plan looks great.*
- *Would like to see the building have less of a suburban feel. It should address the corner.*
- *The club house is a great idea, but needs more expression, more open and light.*
- *The building needs to have a better relationship to the community.*

Jason Sudy:

- *Great direction with the park plan.*
- *This is the place to be a little creative, but you've also had a simple overall strategy. Unique benches and stone structures within the small area between the walkway and the wall can provide infusions of whimsical, unusual characteristics within a more formalized plan.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

16. 16-10-23

732 North Fourth Street

Rob Harris (Applicant)

Jeffrey New Day, LLC (Owner)

The variance package was recommended for approval on January 15, 2013 and modified April 21, 2015. This modification applies only to the lot width and rear yard, as hi-lited in the packet materials.

Modify Previous Variance Recommendation

- Single Unit (detached), Corner Lot (1)(2)
Lot Area – 735 sq. ft.; Lot Width – 20'; Side Yard – 2' along non-fronting street; Total side yard – 5'.
- Single Unit (detached), Interior Lot
Lot Area – 735 sq. ft.; Lot Width – 20'; Side Yard – 3'; Total side yard – 3'.



- Site C and D
- Single Unit (detached)
Lot Area – 735 sq. ft.
- Corner Lot (1)(2) – Lot Width – 20'; Side Yard – 2' along non-fronting street; Total side yard – 3'.
- Interior Lot - Lot Width – 20'; Side Yard – 0'; Total side yard – 3'.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:50 P.M.

17. 16-9-20

847 Hamlet Street

847 Hamlet Street, LLC c/o Mulberry (Applicant/Owner)

An application and rendering have been submitted.

Demolition

- Demolish a portion of the existing, one-story, rear addition.

New Additions to House

- Build a new, one-and-one-half story carriage house at the rear of the lot, with a one-story connector between the existing house and new carriage house.
- Two overhead garage doors to face onto the alley.
- Existing roofline and front porch of existing house to be retained.

18. 16-9-21

245-251 East Third Avenue

Gunzelman Architecture & Interiors (Applicant)

The New Victorians (Owner)

An application and site plan have been submitted. A brick four-plex on this site was demolished ca. 1983.

New Construction

- Construct two (2) new, two-story, single-family dwellings with detached garages, per the submitted site plan.

Request for Variance Recommendation

Lot #1 – 2,590.5 sq. ft.

Lot #2 – 2,689.5 sq. ft.

1) 3332.05(4) – 50' lot width

Lot 1 – 33' – a reduction of 17'

Lot 2 – 33' – a reduction of 17'

2) 3332.15 – 5,000 sq. ft. minimum lot size

Lot 1 – 2,590.5 sq. ft. – a reduction of 2,409.5 sq. ft.

Lot 2 – 2,689.5 sq. ft. – a reduction of 2,310 sq. ft.

3) 3332.21(E) – Building line setback – 25'

Lot 1 – 15' – a reduction of 10'

Lot 2 – 15' – a reduction of 10'

4) 3312.25 – Maneuvering across each lot line – shared driveway

Lot 1 – Yes variance required

Lot 2 – Yes variance required

5) 3312.09(2)(c) – 20' of maneuvering space on each lot

Lot 1 – Yes variance required

Lot 2 – Yes variance required

6) 3332.18(D) – 50% lot coverage

Lot 1 – 2,590.5 sq. ft. – (1,295.25 sq. ft. allowed) - proposed 1,685 sq. ft. an increase of 389.5 sq. ft.

Lot 2 – 2,689.5 sq. ft. – (1,344.75 sq. ft. allowed) - proposed 1,760 sq. ft. an increase of 415.25 sq. ft.

7) 3332.27 – Rear yard – 25% of lot

Lot 1 – 647.5 sq. ft. required - (proposed – 395 sq. ft.) a decrease of 252.5 sq. ft. or 10%



Lot 2 – 672.38 sq. ft. required (proposed – 395 sq. ft.) a decrease of 277.38 sq. ft. or 11%

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 8:15 P.M.

19. 16-10-24

875 N. Fourth Street

Shremshock Architects (Applicant)

Lykens Companies (Owner)

An application, siteplan, and photos have been submitted.

Conceptual Review

- Demolish existing single-story commercial, single-story warehouse/garage, and two-story single-family residence.
- Construct three (3) new buildings, including: (1) three-story building with ground floor retail and 2 floors of apartments above [Building A], (1) three-story apartment building [Building A1], and (1) three-story building with ground floor parking and 2 floors of apartments above [Building B].

20. 16-8-37

839 Summit Street

Ben Goodman & Chris Zuelke (Applicants/Owners)

An application, plan, and drawings have been submitted. Applicant requests to be continued to the October 18, 2016 IVC hearing.

Build New Garage

- Build a new, three-car, shared wall garage
- New garage to be utilized by 839 Summit Street and the neighboring property owner at 843 Summit Street.
- Concrete block garage to have a stepped parapet with metal coping, per the submitted drawings.
- Two, plain, steel overhead doors.
- Service doors to be half-light, steel or fiberglass.
- Goose neck light fixtures to be above each auto and service door.

STAFF APPROVALS

• **16-10-1**

1105 Say Avenue

Heather Minor (Applicant)

Joel Oney & Travis Sanders (Owner)

Approve Application 16-10-1, 1105 Say Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Rear Steps and Patio

- Install new, wood steps from rear French doors, per the submitted drawing. Paint to match existing house color.
- Install new, brick patio, per the submitted drawing.

Note: COA #16-10-1 modifies COA # 16-8-12a, which approved a wood stoop.

• **16-10-2**

1120/1122 Summit Street

Bedford Holdings III LLC/Elizabeth Vorys (Applicant)

Bedford Holdings III LLC(Owner)

Approve Application 16-10-2, 1120/1122 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.



- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Paint the entire building using Sherwin Williams SW7074 Software (gray) for the building and SW7070 Site White for the window trim.

• **16-10-3**

307 East Fifth Avenue

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

New Victorians (Owner)

Approve Application 16-10-3, 307 East Fifth Avenue, for renewal of expired COA # 15-10-5 (Expired: September 23, 2016), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

New Construction/Commercial & Residential Building

- Construct a new 2 ½ story, frame building at the Fifth Avenue frontage with commercial first floor and two residential units on the second floor.
- The following final details to be reviewed and approved by Commissioners Hagerling and/or Boyer: 1) The wrapping of the brick from the façade to the side elevations; 2) location of light fixtures; 3) all siding materials; 4) scupper/downspout location; 5) rear door canopy and stoop; 6) water table details; 7)
- Revised drawing to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with Commissioners Hagerling and/or Boyer, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Cut sheets/specifications for all siding materials, roofing materials, windows, doors, and light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Any/all signage to return to the Italian Village Commission for review and approval.

MOTION: Boyer/Goodman (3-0-1 [Sudy]) APPROVED

• **16-10-4**

946 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

Dan Morgan (Applicant)

Dan and Rachel Morgan (Owners)

Approve Application 16-10-4, 946 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Replace Wood Siding & Exterior Painting/Rear Addition

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood siding and trim elements on the one-story, rear addition, as needed. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood siding and trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the rear addition for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Paint color chips to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for the file.

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair/Rear Addition

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffits and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

• **16-10-5**

1178 North High Street

Muth & Co. Roofing (Applicant)

Dashen Ltd. (Owner)

Approve Application 16-10-5, 1178 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the sloped portion of the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.



- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
 - Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
 - Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
 - Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
 - Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be GAF, Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab), "Nickel Gray."
 - All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
 - Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
 - Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.
- **16-10-6**
159-165 Detroit Avenue
The New Victorians (Applicant/Owner)
Approve Application 16-10-6, 159-165 Detroit Avenue, for renewal of expired COA # 15-8-2 (Expired: July 27, 2016), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.
Install New Windows
 - Remove all existing, non-original windows.
 - Install new, all wood (interior/exterior), one-over-one, double-hung sash windows.
 - All new windows and jambs to fit within the historic window openings.
 - Cut sheet for new wood (interior/exterior) windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.
 - **16-10-7**
94 East Fourth Avenue
Daniel Hollern (Applicant) **Community Housing Network (Owner)**
Approve Application 16-10-7, 94 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:
Remove Existing Sidewalks and Install New Sidewalks
 - Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete service sidewalks, per the submitted photographs, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
 - Install new concrete in the same location and of the same dimension, as needed.
 - All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
 - The existing, brick, public sidewalk is to be retained.
 - **16-10-8**
1164-1166 Mt. Pleasant Avenue
The New Victorians (Applicant/Owner)
Approve Application 16-10-8, 1164-1166 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:
Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof
 - Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
 - Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
 - Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.



- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be GAF, Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab), “Nickel Gray” or Certain Teed (standard 3-tab), “Nickel Gray.”
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **16-10-9**

272 East Fourth Avenue

The New Victorians (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 16-10-9, 272 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Windows

- Remove existing, non-original vinyl, one-over-one, double-hung windows, and the one remaining, wood, three-over-one, double-hung window, and install new all wood (interior/exterior) one-over-one, double-hung windows, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- New window sashes to fit the size of the original window sash openings.
- All exterior casings and trim elements to be restored to the original profile and dimension, as determined by any/all existing, original trim and/or shadow lines, following the removal of the existing aluminum wrap. All trim to project ½” to ¾” above the surface of the existing vinyl siding.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on all elevations of the building using the appropriate hand tools. Solid prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

Repair Vinyl Siding

- Remove any existing, cracked or damaged vinyl siding.
- Install new sections of vinyl siding to match the existing color and profile, as needed, like-for-like.

Install New Concrete Stoop

- Remove the deteriorated, concrete stoop at the front entrance, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install a new concrete stoop in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension.
- Remove the existing, deteriorated wood porch post and install a new wood post to match existing.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

• **16-10-10**

78 East Lincoln Street

Punch Out Plus, LLC. (Applicant)

Dyan Ellinger & Brian Yarbrough (Owners)

Approve Application 16-10-10, 78 East Lincoln Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Porch Rehabilitation

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers’ specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new, tongue and groove wooden, porch flooring.



- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; paint color to match existing "gray."
- Repair/restore the front porch columns, as needed, with like material of same dimension and profile as the existing, original, front porch columns; like-for-like.

- **16-10-11**

1016 Summit Street

Shannon Fergus (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 16-10-11, 1016 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Windows

- Remove the four (4) existing, non-original vinyl, one-over-one, double-hung windows on the façade (left side of the duplex), and install new Pella Architect Series, all wood (interior/exterior) one-over-one, double-hung windows, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- New window sashes to fit the size of the original window sash openings.
- All exterior casings and trim elements to be restored to the original profile and dimension, as determined by any/all existing, original trim and/or shadow lines, following the removal of the existing aluminum wrap (Note existing carved wood corner blocks on third floor window).
- All trim to project ½" to ¾" above the surface of the existing fiber cement siding.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on all elevations of the building using the appropriate hand tools. Solid prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

- **16-10-12**

1062 Hamlet Street

Mike Miller (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 16-10-12, 1062 Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Exterior Painting House & Garage

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements on the house, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house and new garage for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Paint color scheme to be as follows, per the submitted color chips: Body – Sherwin Williams "Interesting Aqua;" Trim – Sherwin Williams "Extra White."
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., concrete porch columns, foundation, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.



- **16-10-13**

1088-1090 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

Emily Tanoury and Colleen Will (Applicants/Owners)

Approve Application 16-10-13, 1088-1090 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Front Doors

- Remove the existing, two (2), non-original, fiberglass front doors.
- Install new wood doors in the two (2), existing door openings. New doors to be Uber, Krosswood, Knotty Alder, half-light doors, per the submitted product cut sheet. Glass is to be clear, with no texture, decorative pattern, or muntins. Paint color to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- Existing transoms to be retained and restored.

Install New Rear Doors

- Remove the existing, two (2), non-original, fiberglass rear doors.
- Install new, smooth, fiberglass, half-light doors in the two (2), existing door openings. Glass is to be clear, with no texture, decorative pattern, or muntins. Product cut sheet/specifications to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff prior to installation.
- Existing transoms to be retained and restored.

Repair Masonry Retaining Wall

- Remove any/all damaged concrete block and replace with concrete block that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- Moisten surface with water and solid point with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings” <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).
- The height, thickness, and length of the masonry wall is to remain the same following the completion of all repairs.

Repair Rear Entry Steps

- Repair and level, or remove the existing, concrete rear entry steps at 1090 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as needed, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete steps in the same location and of the same dimension.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

Install New Patios

- Install new patios inside the currently fenced rear yards of 1088 and 1090 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, per the submitted site plan.
- Patios to be permeable pavers to allow for appropriate drainage.
- Existing fence dividing the two properties to remain in place.
- Existing tree to remain in place.
- Install new plantings, per the submitted site plan.

- **16-10-14**

1146 Summit Street

1146 Summit LLC. (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 16-10-14, 1146 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.



- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Install New Doors

- Remove the existing, non-original, six-panel front and rear doors.
- Install new, doors within the original openings.
- Style to be chosen from the illustration on page 35 of the Italian Village Guidelines.
- Door cut sheet to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffits and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Repair/Replace Siding

- Repair/replace any/all original, existing, deteriorated wood siding with any/all new wood siding to match the original wood siding profile and dimension exactly; like-for-like.
- Any/all repaired/replaced exterior trim elements (i. e. window & door trim, corner boards, eave soffit & fascia, crown moldings, etc.) to be restored to the original profile and dimension as determined by any/all existing, original trim and/or shadow lines following the removal of the existing siding and any/all non-original trim repair patches. All trim to project ½” to ¾” above the surface of the new wood siding.
- Prepare all exterior wooden surfaces on all elevations of the building using the appropriate hand tools.
- Solid prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Install New Windows

- All original, wood windows are completely or partially missing or deteriorated beyond repair.
- Remove any existing deteriorated windows.
- Install new all wood (interior/exterior), one-over-one, double-hung sash windows, per the submitted product cut sheets/specifications.
- All window transoms to be retained, per the submitted window sash cut sheets.

• **16-10-15**

920 North High Street

Mark Olson/ArchAll (Applicant)

Emerald ECP Short North (Owner)

Item # 1 was moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the October 11th, 2016 IVC Business Meeting.

Approve Application 16-10-15, 920 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Modify Previous Approval/New Construction/Trash & Mechanicals Enclosure

- Add a new 36”, flush metal door on the east elevation of the trash and mechanicals enclosure, to match existing doors, per the submitted drawings. Rendering or cut sheet to be provided to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Add a new, 2’ 6” high, steel screen with angled slats at the top of the trash and mechanicals enclosure on the south and east elevations, painted black, per the submitted drawings. Provided to screen three small condensing units on top of the mechanicals room.
- Add a new 36” x 36” metal louver, painted black, on the south elevation of the trash and mechanicals enclosure, per the submitted drawings.



- **16-10-17**

148-150 Detroit Avenue

Urban Restorations (Applicant/Owner)

Item # 2 was moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the October 11th, 2016 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).

Approve Application 16-10-17, 148-150 Detroit Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Landscaping for New Construction

- Install new patio in rear yard, per the submitted site plan. Pavers to be Oberfields ‘Vintage Washington,’ per the submitted product cut sheet.
- Install new, low, accent wall along Beacon Alley and along the existing public sidewalk along Detroit Avenue.
- Install new utility screen fence at the rear of the residence, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new privacy hedge and other plantings, per the submitted site plan.

- **16-8-20a**

1014 North High Street

Brent Racer/New Avenue Architects & Engineers (Applicant)

Fireproof Partners, LLC (Owner)

Item # 4 was moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the October 11th, 2016 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).

Approve Application 16-8-20, 1014 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Expand Patio

- Extend the existing outdoor seating area to wrap around the facade of the tenant space, per the submitted drawing.
- Remove a section of the existing railing and existing foliage, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new railings along the High Street façade, to match existing, per the submitted site plan.

- **16-10-18**

995 North Fourth Street

Adrienne Consales (Applicant)

Capitol Equities (Owner)

Item # 7 was moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the October 11th, 2016 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).

Approve Application 16-10-18, 1014 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Signage

- Install one (1) new “ghost painted” sign with restaurant name, “COSECHA,” on the façade, per the submitted rendering (approx. 17 sq. ft.).
- Applicant is to create one (1) sample letter, to be viewed and approved by Commissioner Goodman, prior to installation of the painted sign on the building.
- Install one (1) new, individually cut ¼” thick aluminum, “pigeon” graphic, per the submitted rendering.
- Cut out mounted to wall with concealed studs. Studs to be placed into mortar, not into face of brick.

Install New Lighting

- Install three (3) new gooseneck light fixtures, per the submitted rendering.
- Cut sheet for light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **16-10-19**

200 (201) East Fourth Avenue

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Heidi Koestner (Owner)

Item # 8 was moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the October 11th, 2016 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).

Approve Application 16-10-19, 200 (201) East Fourth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Alterations to Façade

- Modify existing façade to accommodate new use as a restaurant.



- Repair existing roof coping, like-for-like.
- Paint the previously painted concrete block. Color(s) to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval (including for the “200.”
- Install new, black anodized metal and glass overhead garage door with solid panels at top and bottom. Cut sheet to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Install new, three-quarter lite, wood front entrance door.
- Install new, metal or fiberglass, industrial style, casement windows. Cut sheet to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

X. OLD BUSINESS

• 16-10-16

809 Beacon Alley

Charles Kuhlman/Segna Associates (Applicant)

Wood Run Partners (Owner)

A new, two unit residence and new coach house residence were approved as 812 Summit Street (COA # 15-6-18/July 21, 2015). COA # 15-6-18 included a detailed description of the two unit residence, but did not include a description of the coach house residence. Final drawings for the two unit residence were stamped and issued May 2016. Final drawings have recently been submitted separately for the coach house. A renewal of expired COA # 15-6-18 is required and now includes a detailed description of the coach house, as follows:

Approve Application 16-10-16, 809 Beacon Alley, as submitted and with all specifications indicated.

New Construction/Coach House Residence

- Build a new, one-and-one-half story, frame coach house residence, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Exterior cladding to be James Hardie, **smooth**, board-and-batten siding with Certain Teed Smart Trim.
- Pedestrian doors on south and north elevations to be four-panel. Cut sheet to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Two steel overhead garage doors to be on east elevation. Cut sheet to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Windows to be Jeld Wen, aluminum-clad wood, per the submitted product cut sheets.
- Roofing shingles to be Certain Teed, (standard 3-tab), “Nickel Gray.”

XI. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURNMENT

